Finding an Advisor and Developing an Effective Working Relationship with Them

Nancy Amato, University of Illinois Theophilus Benson, Brown University



Theophilus in One Slide

2004	Startup	Assistant Professor @Brown
2006	Grad School	 Academic Background: PhD: U of Wisconsin Madison Post-Doc: Princeton
2012	Post Doc	 Research: Networking and Distributed Systems Improving web performance more reliable cloud infrastructures
2013	Assistant Prof.	Fun-stuff Rock climbing Amateur runner



Nancy in Brief

- PhD @ UIUC; MS @ Berkeley; BS applied math & econ
 @ Stanford
- Prof @Texas A&M: 1995-2018
- Prof & Dept Head (back at) @UIUC: since Jan
- Research Applied Algorithms
 - robotics, computational biology & geometry, parallel algorithms
 - Graduated 3 PhDs (10 profs, 9 research labs,
 2 postdocs, 3 startups)
- Other stuff
 - Bernese Mountain Dogs (currently Fred & Wilma)
 - Husband Lawrence grad school, A&M & UIUC
 - Recent highlights: bucket trip to Machu Picchu, Diving!



Outline

- What is a good advisor?
- How to find an advisor?
- How to manage your advisor?
- Discussing change with your advisor!



A PhD program is an Apprenticeship

An ideal advisor

- a good research advisor
- a good mentor
- a good fit



What should a good advisor/mentor do?

- Teach you fundamental research skills. How to
 - Prepare papers, talks, & proposals
 - Critically read the literature
 - Technical foundations
- Guide you to find a research topic & develop your identity as a researcher
- Demonstrate for you balance, research ethics, an intellectual roadmap
- Foster your career development through your PhD to your first job & promotion...and next job and promotion
 This is a life-long relationship



Finding An Advisor



How to find a good advisor/mentor

When looking for an advisor in a new university

- Get to know them and get them to know you
- Be persistent (but don't pester)
- Know their research, read their papers, and ask informed questions
- Meet in person
- Talk on the phone
- Talk to multiple grad students in the lab! (including graduated students)
- Understand expectations about workload (courses vs research) and funding



How to find a good advisor/mentor

- Get to know your potential advisor(s)
 - Meet them (in person/skype/phone)
 - Know their research
 - read their papers
 - Be persistent (but don't pester)
 - and ask informed questions
- Get to know their lab culture
 - Talk to multiple grad students in the lab!
 - including graduated students
 - (and) ex-students
 - Understand expectations about workload
 - (courses vs research)
 - Impact of funding structure



Assess the Advisor Fit

- Assess fit along multiple dimension:
 - Research topics
 - Advising style
 - Lab culture/structure
 - Support for URM-D
 - Status within the community
 - Expectations from students

Be Systematic in analysis of potential advisors



Assess the fit

- Find leaders in research topics you are passionate about
- Your advisor should be respected in the field
- Deep thinker who encourages students to do seminal work vs the job done
- Where do you fit in their lab? What is the lab structure?
- Understand what they expect from their grad students
- What is their philosophical bent? Does it align with yours?
- Is the advisor supportive of women, URM and students with disabilities?
- Be systematic in your assessment as though you were assessment as the your assessment as though you were assessment as though you were as the your assessment as t

Finding advisors for interdisciplinary research

- One, two or more advisors and mentors? Often, it takes a village.
- Do they appropriately balance breadth vs depth of research?
- Do they have a core identity that supports or overlaps with yours?
- Are they open-minded and enthusiastic about learning from other fields?
- Can they provide financial support for interdisciplinary research?
- Will you find a community of researchers that support your work?



Finding advisors for interdisciplinary research

- One, two or more advisors and mentors? Often, it takes a village.
- Do they appropriately balance breadth vs depth of research?
- Do they have a core identity that supports or overlaps with yours?
- Are they open-minded and enthusiastic about learning from other fields?
- Can they provide financial support for interdisciplinary research?
- Will you find a community of researchers that support your work?



Exercise: Ask Faculty Member to Work with them

- Pair up with a partner
- You will role play talking with a faculty member in their office and ask them if you can join their research group.
- Take 2 minutes to do this, and then switch roles.



Managing Your Advisor



Communication is key to management

- Multiple vehicles for communication
 - Weekly meetings
 - Group meeting
 - One-on-one
 - Emails
 - Keep emails short and direct
 - All messages are read --> responses may be slow
- Ask for more time if you need it



Make the Most of Every Interaction

- Mentally outline the meeting
 - Identify discussion points
 - Verify/validate the motivation behind each discussion point
 - Send out an agenda before the meeting
- Double-check results and assumptions
- Maintain project archives
 - Take notes, organize them, and send out summaries



Make the Most of Every Interaction

- Mentally outline the meeting
 - Identify discussion points
 - Verify/validate the motivation behind each discussion point
 - Send out an agenda before the meeting
- Double-check results and assumptions
- Maintain project archives
 - Take notes, organize them, and send out summaries



Discussing Change



What if its not working....

Sometimes, despite all your good efforts, things don't work. How to handle it depends on the situation

- poor working style fit
 - can often be addressed, if all else is ok
- poor research fit
 - harder to fix, but decision depends on how far along you are and your long term goals
- something more serious is wrong
 - requires major adjustment

Try to remember, changing advisors is NOT the end of the world:

- In most cases, if you feel there is a problem then your advisor likely feels that way as well
- While changing advisors may cost some time, it may be less than you think and may be made up by better results/outcomes



Exercise: Hard discussions with your advisor

- Pair up with a partner. Pick one of the topics of discussion with your advisor, or another of your choosing, and role play it with your partner.
- Take 2 minutes to do this, and then switch roles.

Scenarios:

- Tell your advisor you would like to work on one of the other projects in your group.
- Tell your advisor you feel you should be a co-author on a paper your labmate is working on.
- Tell your advisor you are ready to graduate.



Final Thoughts



Take home messages

Do your research! Look for

- A good research advisor
 - Productively engaged in research you are passionate about
 - Willing and able to effectively teach and guide you in research
 - Able to help fund your research
- A good mentor
 - Cares about your career & effectively supports your success
- A good fit
 - Personalities, research style & philosophy, lab structure and people
- It takes a village: You may need more than one advisor and mentor
- It's a two way street: Communicate to your advisor the support that you need
 & try to work out problems



Questions?

Resources

A site with some good tips (some of which we've adopted & adapted for this talk):
 https://greatresearch.org/2013/08/14/managing-your-advisor/

